# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN

# **MINUTES**

CASE CAPTION: City of Grand Rapids v. Grand Rapids Police Command Officers Assoc, et al

**Case Number:** 1:17-cv-113

Date: April 15, 2019

**Time:** 8:57 a.m. – 10:28 a.m.

10:52 a.m. – 12:11 p.m. 2:14 p.m. – 3:15 p.m.

Place: Kalamazoo

Judge: Paul L. Maloney

#### **APPEARANCES**

Plaintiff/Counter-Defendant: Scott E. Dwyer and Benjamin C. Dilley

Defendant Grand Rapids Police Command Officers Association: Andrew J. Gordon Defendant/Counter-Claimant Matthew Janiskee: Andrew J. Rodenhouse and Charles C. Newberg

## **PROCEEDINGS**

Nature of Hearing: Bench Trial – Day 1: opening statements by all parties; Plaintiff's presentation of evidence

### **WITNESSES:**

Daniel Savage, David Schnurstein, David Kiddle, Patrick Merrill, Peter McWaters, Paul Klimas

#### **EXHIBITS:**

Description	Admitted
Joint Exhibits: 1 through 49	Yes by stipulation
De Bene Esse Depositions	Yes by stipulation
Plaintiff/Counter-Defendant's Exhibits: 1, 5 (Bates Stamped GR 292, 296), 6, 7 (Bates Stamped GR 325-329), 8	Yes
Defendant GRPCOA's Exhibits: (none)	
Defendant/Counter-Claimant Janiskee's Exhibits: A, B	Yes

Court Reporter: Kathleen Thomas Case Manager: Amy Redmond